

# TOWN OF MIDDLEBURG HISTORIC DISTRICT REVIEW COMMITTEE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES



## Thursday, January 9, 2023 PENDING APPROVAL

The regular meeting of the Historic District Review Committee was held on Monday, January 9, 2023, in the Town Hall Council Chambers. Chair Clites called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m. Planning & Project Associate LaClare called the roll.

PRESENT: Tim Clites, Chair

Punkin Lee, Vice Chair William Anderson Virginia Jenkins Linda Wright

Cindy C. Pearson, Council Representative

STAFF: Will Moore, Deputy Town Manager

Rhonda S. North, MMC, Town Clerk (arrived late) Estee LaClare, Planning & Project Associate

ABSENT: Margaret Littleton

#### **Approval of Minutes**

Committee Member Jenkins moved, seconded by Councilmember Pearson, that the Historic District Review Committee approve the December 1, 2022 Regular Meeting Minutes as submitted.

Vote: Yes - Committee Members Lee, Anderson, Jenkins, and Wright and Councilmember Pearson

No - N/AAbstain - N/A

Absent – Committee Member Littleton

(Chair Clites only votes in the case of a tie.)

\_\_\_\_\_

#### **New Business**

<u>COA-RS 22-09:</u> New Single-Family Dwelling - 610 Martingale Ridge Drive (Middleburg Residences Lot 14)

Gretchen Yahn appeared before the Committee representing the application. She reviewed the details of the proposed design. It was noted that this was a design – the Hunt Box – which had not been presented to the Committee previously. It was also noted that it was a more traditional design.

The Committee held some discussion of the application.

Chair Clites moved, seconded by Councilmember Pearson, that the Historic District Review Committee approve COA-RS 22-09 as presented.

Vote: Yes - Committee Members Lee, Anderson, Jenkins, and Wright and Councilmember Pearson

No-N/A Abstain-N/A Absent-Committee Member Littleton (Chair Clites only votes in the case of a tie.)

......

Ms. Yahn questioned whether the Committee had a preference as to the direction the siding should go on the dormer.

The Committee noted that they did not feel strongly one way or the other on that.

<u>COA-RS 22-10:</u> New Single-Family Dwelling – 800 Old Saddle Drive (Middleburg Residences Lot 49)

Gretchen Yahn appeared before the Committee representing the application. She reminded the members that they had seen this design before and noted that it was The Stables hybrid with The Vineyard floor plan. Ms. Yahn advised that it would not contain a front porch but rather would have large windows on the front, with the porch being on the back of the house. She reminded the Committee that the intent of The Stables plan was for the structures to be barn like. Ms. Yahn advised that they would probably come out with a different Stables model, as people felt it was too large and were not opting for it.

In response to inquiries from the Committee, Ms. Yahn advised that the barn door on the right elevation would be decorative. She confirmed the window layout on the left elevation was proposed as it was due to the need for wall space inside the structure, as this was where the bed walls and closets were located. Ms. Yahn advised that as to what the neighbors adjacent to the left elevation would see would depend on the model home they selected. She suggested the design spoke to the need for additional landscaping.

The Committee held some discussion as to possible solutions for the left elevation, which included the addition of an architectural element, such as faux windows or faux shutters. Ms. Yahn advised that she had no problem adding fake shutters.

The Committee noted that, on the left elevation, the windowsill defined the bottom of the fascia. They held considerable discussion as to whether this was acceptable or whether there should be an adjustment. The members discussed options such as beefing up the windowsill and setting the window deeper into the stucco.

In response to inquiries from the Committee, Ms. Yahn advised that the stucco was real stucco on a perma-base. She explained that it was a monolithic system, with a custom color. Ms. Yahn advised that as to the fascia and windowsill, she would prefer to pull the window head up so there would not be a wider board on the bottom.

The Committee continued their discussion. They questioned, if the window was pushed up by two inches, whether the fascia should remain in the same location so there would be an apron under the windowsill or whether the freeze should be reduced, with the windowsill overhanging the stucco without a sill. They opined that having the heavier board on top was better because the mass of stucco underneath would give greater balance to the roof. They expressed a preference for a deeper sill, leaving it in the stucco, for a wider fascia, and for the addition of an apron.

Ms. Yahn suggested the stucco be taken up to the fascia and that each window be picture framed with a more substantial sill and an apron so they would read like windows. In response to an inquiry from the Committee, she advised that the fascia would be Riviera Pewter in color. She noted that everything would be that color.

The Committee noted that it was important to remember that there would be no contrast in colors between the trim and the stucco – that it would just be a change in textures. They agreed that because of this, it was important to leave the fascia in the design. The Committee noted that on the right elevation, the trim stopped at the rear wall.

Ms. Yahn opined that it would be better if this read as windows and not as fascia.

The Committee noted that the same thing occurred where the stucco came down the side of the dormer.

Ms. Yahn opined that it should read as stucco and that the windows should read as windows, with an apron. In response to an inquiry from the Committee, Ms. Yahn confirmed she would eliminate the fascia and would let the stucco go up for a modern farmhouse appearance. In response to an inquiry from the Committee, she advised that the vertical lines were the black downspouts. She explained that the one between the double window would create a water break-up to move the water to the sides.

The Committee noted that the windows on the first floor would be 3'x4' and suggested they looked small in proportion to the overall elevation. It was noted, however, that the downspouts would help frame the windows. The members opined that there was a lot of stucco and suggested the second floor looked busy.

Ms. Yahn suggested she revise the elevation to include a set of twins on each side, as opposed to faux shutters, so they would look the same as what was above. She opined that this would help with the massing.

The Committee opined that it would be helpful to have a human figure shown in each elevation in order to get a sense of the scale.

Committee Member Anderson moved to approve COA-RS 22-10 with the following comments: on the left elevation, the lower 3'x4' windows would be shuttered with passive shutters; downspouts would be added between the dormers as shown, like the other downspouts; the fascia board would be removed; and, the dormer windows would be profiled with trim.

The Committee held discussion as to whether faux shutters should be added to the small windows or whether faux shutters should be added under the dormers to take up part of the elevation.

Ms. Yahn advised that they would install a window frame with the shutters. She noted that the hardware would be visible. Ms. Yahn advised that it did not matter to her which way the Committee preferred this be handled.

After some discussion, it was clear there did not appear to be an understanding of what was being proposed. In response to an inquiry from the Committee as to whether a decision needed to be made immediately, Deputy Town Manager Moore suggested he issue the zoning permit pending a resolution of this matter. He recommended the Committee table action on the application, with the understanding that he could clear the zoning permit. Mr. Moore suggested the application return to the Committee at their next meeting.

Ms. Yahn suggested she provide two elevation options for the Committee's consideration.

In response to an inquiry from the Committee, Chair Clites reminded the members that a faux shutter simply meant it would not be operational.

Committee Member Anderson withdrew his original motion. Committee Member Anderson moved, seconded by Chair Clites, that action on COA-RS 22-10 be tabled until the next meeting.

Vote: Yes – Committee Members Lee, Anderson, Jenkins, and Wright and Councilmember Pearson

No - N/AAbstain - N/A

Absent – Committee Member Littleton

(Chair Clites only votes in the case of a tie.)

COA-RS 22-11: New Single-Family Dwelling – 609 Martingale Ridge Drive (Middleburg Residences Lot 15)

Chair Clites noted that this application was similar in planning and elevation to the first one the Committee considered; however, it used stucco as the primary façade material, with siding on the enclosed porches.

Gretchen Yahn appeared before the Committee representing the application. In response to an inquiry, she confirmed the same stone would be carried throughout.

The Committee agreed they liked the right elevation, as it provided character to the structure. It was noted that downspouts were not shown on the drawings.

Ms. Yahn noted that she didn't typically show the downspouts; however, she could in the future.

Committee Member Anderson moved, seconded by Committee Member Wright, that the Historic District Review Committee approve COA-RS 22-11 as presented.

Vote: Yes – Committee Members Lee, Anderson, Jenkins, and Wright and Councilmember Pearson

No - N/A

Abstain – N/A

Absent – Committee Member Littleton

(Chair Clites only votes in the case of a tie.)

\_\_\_\_\_\_

In response to a request from Ms. Yahn for clarification as to why they were only allowed to have a one car garage in The Vineyards, the Committee advised that this was a zoning question that needed to be directed to Deputy Town Manager Moore.

#### **Discussion Items**

#### 2023 Historic Preservation Awards

Planning & Project Associate LaClare advised that she wanted the members to think about the nominations for the two awards. She reported that she developed a list of the approved projects over the past three years and noted that she identified those businesses that were no longer in existence in Middleburg. The Committee noted that Item 17 was also no longer in business.

Planning & Project Associate LaClare reminded the members of their desire to give out the awards in May to coincide with Historic Preservation Month. She asked the members to think about which projects stood out as possible nominees and to submit their recommendations to her. Ms. LaClare suggested the members discuss the possible nominees at their next meeting.

Chair Clites reminded the members that the Legacy Award could be given to a person, building or institution.

#### Middleburg Walking Tour

Planning & Project Associate LaClare reported that using the various walking tour pamphlets that have been developed by organizations throughout the years, she developed a walking tour that expanded upon the information that already existed and included additional properties. She asked for the members' feedback on her draft document and noted that there was no deadline for doing so. Ms. LaClare advised that the Business Development & Community Partnerships Director would like to use it to highlight historic properties on social media, as well as the Town's website.

The Committee suggested that some of the descriptions needed to include more of the history on the properties. They cited the Pink Box and Charter School as examples.

Planning & Project Associate LaClare asked that the members share any information/history they may have with her.

The Committee noted that the property located at 209 East Washington Street was previously used as the Methodist Parsonage.

National Alliance of Preservation Commission's Webinar on Mid-Century Housing from Planning to Preservation

Planning & Project Associate LaClare noted that she provided the members with a synopsis of the webinar so they could determine whether they would like to watch it. She asked that the members let her know how many hours of training they had taken so she could include it in the CLG renewal application. Ms. LaClare reminded the members that the sessions took between 1.5 to 3 hours to complete.

Councilmember Pearson reported that she participated in one training session. Committee Member Jenkins noted that she participated in a training session and watched the webinar.

#### Meeting Recordings

Town Clerk North reported that more people were watching the Town's meetings as they were live streamed or watched the recordings at a later time. She advised that she was beginning to get complaints from those audience members about their inability to hear what was being said. Ms. North reminded the members of the need to turn on their microphones and to speak into them during the meeting. She also noted the need to make sure only one individual was speaking at a time and that the members identify themselves. Ms. North noted that the most recent complaint was about people in the audience who were speaking from the back of the room. She advised that she spoke with the staff about the need to come forward to the microphone when speaking and was trying to signal members of the audience about the need to not carry on conversations amongst themselves during the middle of a meeting.

Chair Clites asked Town Clerk North to provide a reminder of this at the start of the meetings.

#### **Quorum – February Meeting**

Those members who were present indicated they would be present for the February 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:53 p.m.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED:

### **HDRC Meeting Transcript – January 9, 2023**

(Note: This is a transcript prepared by a Town contractor based on the video of the meeting. It may not be entirely accurate. For greater accuracy, we encourage you to review the video of the meeting that is on the Town's website – <a href="https://www.middleburgva.gov">www.middleburgva.gov</a>)

Note: Due to a staff error, the meeting recording did not begin until 6:00 p.m. As such, the meeting recording and transcript are of the meeting already in session.

**Gretchen Yahn:** Draw that elevation. I mean, we draw that side elevation, pulling that up, pulling the head height up more.

**Tim Clites:** What does anybody else in the committee think?

Bill Anderson: Such a subjective.

**Tim Clites:** Well, I know that's why I'm asking.

**Bill Anderson:** This way, but you might not either.

**Tim Clites:** And that's why I'm asking because.

**Bill Anderson:** I don't know. My first inclination would be that the window, actually. I can't really answer it because you have to look at the section to see where the window falls inside and all that. So I would beef up the sill where the sill is and make it deeper into the stucco. Which brings up a question I have, and I apologize for not remembering. Maybe you remember Tim or somebody else. What is the construction of this stucco wall? What's what is this stucco? Is this real stucco?

Gretchen Yahn: Yes.

**Bill Anderson:** It is real stucco on.

**Gretchen Yahn:** It's on perma base now and on top of.

**Bill Anderson:** Joints and stucco. If you look at the other elevation where you have the two full two stories. And you know, just. I guess it's like on the.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah. Well they, I mean if. Yeah, there's that's a whole longer discussion. I've done plenty of huge walls with no joints in residential because I don't want to see them. You could hide them behind all the gutters downspouts if you needed. Which is a bit of a you don't quite meet the criteria, but you get close.

**Bill Anderson:** Well but if it is real and that's a definition and real stucco. Real stucco ultimately will crack. And that's going to be a problem.

**Gretchen Yahn:** That's not totally true anymore.

Bill Anderson: Yeah, it is. What does real stucco on mean.

**Gretchen Yahn:** So, you know. Well, real stucco used to mean, you know, we could take and take just old lime and put in some horsehair in it and throw it up on a wall. But, you know, nowadays it's not, you

know, the differentiation is more like the old where they would put Styrofoam up on the wall and then do a stowe coat on top of it. Now that's not real stucco, but from the standpoint of using perma base and using polymer types of fillers in the stucco, you can get much further apart with your joints and the like than you used to.

**Tim Clites:** So the topcoat is more flexible.

Gretchen Yahn: Yeah, it's much more flexible. And we use perma base, you know, it used to be they would use tar paper and then they'd put on lath, and I mean I could tell you a bajillion houses one right down here that we took off 20 years later that were nothing but a mold pond behind them. So, you know, it doesn't mean because the moniker of the term real stucco, I mean, yes, it is real stucco. It's not being put on with stick pins that are going to come off in a freeze thaw, you know, with respect to this. But, you know, that doesn't mean it's you know, it's bad to use a perma base, which is a better product anymore than what we used to have. There are monolithic systems I think that's a better way for you to to to to say it as a nomenclature. It's a monolithic system.

**Tim Clites:** And is the color mixed into the topcoat or is it paint? Is it painted over [multiple speakers]

Gretchen Yahn: Yeah, we're custom coloring all of these. So you could call it, it's a cementitious stucco again, depending on how we want to you know, there's different finishes that can come with that. They used to do different finishes based on the aggregate that they use. Now we have different things that we can put into it. I personally like a very smooth sandy stucco. I don't want something with Pebble Dash or anything else in it, But, you know, it is you know, that's what you have. It would be on a house. You know, I redid a house Fenway Farm that had you know, there's parts of that house that were from the 1800s. Did we go back with it with horsehair plaster, I mean, stucco? No, we did not. So that's my only kind of point I'm going to have to make on that.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah, Well, and so but the back up to the question of like, how does that then integrate with integrate with the trim and whether it's worth looking at. I mean, I could imagine that we're going to see this model or some variation thereof again, perhaps in stucco. So since it's the first time we've looked at it, that's what I want to ask the committee. Is it worth looking at, you know, or seeing? Do we feel like we need to ask for clarification on anything? I think it's easy enough for us to envision the faux shutters without needing a drawing per se. Maybe there's an updated drawing sent to Will, to have it first records. But the question is do we need to look at this other detail or is it kind of like it's dealer's choice and we are okay with the aesthetic?

**Bill Anderson:** You're talking about now, the fascia, the windowsill.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah, that whole question. Right.

**Bill Anderson:** [inaudible]

**Gretchen Yahn:** I would prefer not to see a cookie cutter. I would prefer not to see it as kind of reading as a window and a. And then like we were just saying and then have nothing. And I just I'd rather see something a little more monolithic. I'd rather push up a little bit so that we don't have this wider board on the bottom.

**Tim Clites:** So let me ask this question, though. Let's say based on the elevation that's right here and for those of you that don't want to follow along, you don't need to. But let's say we pushed the window up two inches, Would we keep the bottom of the fascia where it is so that we had an apron underneath the windowsill? Or do we not care? Would we instead just reduce the freeze and keep the windows sill basically as something that overhangs the stucco without an apron? Yeah. Yeah you.

**Bill Anderson:** I think that the heavier board is better up on top because the mass of stucco underneath to me gives a greater balance to the roof. So I don't mind the wider fascia. The only thing I see get get lost in this is the sill doesn't have any depth. That is I mean, on two dimensionally depth. I would rather see a deeper sill leave the wider fascia across there because when you look at it as a whole, I think it gives more. substance to it. So I wouldn't change that. Just the sill. I'd make the sill more substantial. [inaudible] sill to a window. The sills below are bigger then the windows below.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah. And so in order to do that, than are we comfortable if that window were to shift up.

**Bill Anderson:** No bring the sill into the stucco.

**Tim Clites:** Bring the cell into the stucco.

**Bill Anderson:** Yeah, it's in the stucco now. Just make it more substantial. If you blow it up and, you know, it's in the stucco.

**Gretchen Yahn:** Well, you're talking about making it not not only so much a projection issue. You're talking about making it more of an apron issue like you have on A.

**Tim Clites:** Right. He's saying just add the apron like A and keep the deeper. And by the way, I thank you. I appreciate your observations about the height of the fascia as it relates to a more solid base than the siding. That's the kind of input. Yeah, that that helps us. Helps me at least wrap my mind around. It's fine to leave that. How do you feel about that? I mean, I guess you feel like it's a little saw toothy, but I think the argument, well, that it authenticates all of the other details.

**Gretchen Yahn:** I would argue then that that. Not argue that I would say that what I would do then is I would take this I would take the stucco all the way up to all the way up to the to the fascia. And then I would picture frame each one of these, then and then have our have our the more substantial because then it makes sense to have the apron, because then it reads as a window. So it's either got to read as a window.

**Tim Clites:** Punching down into the stucco completely. It's not a near miss.

Bill Anderson: What are the colors of fascia right now?

**Gretchen Yahn:** Well, this one here, I think was Riviera Pewter. [multiple speakers] Everything's the same color.

**Bill Anderson:** So the stucco and the fascia boards is the same color.

Gretchen Yahn: Yeah. Yeah.

**Tim Clites:** This is pretty consistent for all these projects.

**Gretchen Yahn:** Yeah. So I would speak to the fact that it reads as a window and then it doesn't carry across. It would be, it would just be the window and they would have the more substantial sill that he wants with the apron.

**Bill Anderson:** To me that just and again you have to see a truly understand it I guess but that to me envisioning it means that there's just more stucco in this large wall of stucco as opposed to.

Gretchen Yahn: I agree.

**Bill Anderson:** You know.

Gretchen Yahn: I agree.

**Tim Clites:** But there is something that you see around these like windows that are just just barely engaged through the cornice of the soffit. Right. And there's a house in Upperville where the glass comes down through it. I mean, I could, you know, that'd be fine.

**Bill Anderson:** I'm talking broad idea, broad terms, you know what I mean? Hat, you know, body. Dark light.

**Tim Clites:** That's the important thing for us to remember. There's no contrast between trim and stucco. It's a textural, right. And so this same solution, whatever it is coming back, if it becomes a siding house the next time, again, the only difference is the texture of the materials, not the color.

**Bill Anderson:** That's a good point, because if it comes back to the siding house, I think it's even more important to leave the fascia in. So you don't get this slamming up of the siding to. Anyway.

**Gretchen Yahn:** I would think you'd have your windows read as windows and your siding would be your siding. I mean, I don't think there's any wrong answer. I think that's what it's.

**Tim Clites:** Gretchen, let me ask this. I also want to zoom in and look at. That Gable when it gets to the. If you look at the rear elevation, that piece of trim we're talking about, when it gets to the end of the wall stops.

**Gretchen Yahn:** Well, and that's why I think that it would be best if we had it right as a window and not as the fascia. Because one of the things that we have seen with respect to it is I've not wanted to do, you know, dog ears or dog houses on the ends. You'll know we have no [multiple speakers] We've got our traditional turn. So it speaks to. [inaudible]

**Bill Anderson:** That's a very good.

**Tim Clites:** Sorry to interrupt. The same issue happens above where you have the stucco coming down the side of the dormer. But what you're really do is the stucco is coming down to the edge of that.

**Gretchen Yahn:** So that's why I think it should read as stucco and the windows should read as windows and have the apron. And it kind of addresses what Bill's asking for.

**Tim Clites:** I'm egging them on a little bit. I just want to have a good discussion about it, so we understand.

**Gretchen Yahn:** I hate just kind of dog houses on the ends of these things. So you can notice we have none.

**Tim Clites:** But it's a very traditional detail and you have been trying to kind.

Gretchen Yahn: be more modern.

Tim Clites: Edit that back a little.

**Bill Anderson:** I agree with you. You're right. I missed that side elevation.

**Tim Clites:** I just thought, What does that mean? It means you probably get rid of the fascia, right?

**Gretchen Yahn:** Yeah. [multiple speakers]

Bill Anderson: You would be trimmed all the way around without a fascia board, Let the stucco go up.

Gretchen Yahn: Yeah. That's what I'd rather do.

**Tim Clites:** And it's a more contemporary detail.

Gretchen Yahn: It's more modern farmhouse. Definitely.

**Bill Anderson:** I agree with that.

**Gretchen Yahn:** So I say we have the window read as the window. Then have the apron underneath and then get rid of the fascia.

Gretchen Yahn: I agree.

**Bill Anderson:** I agree. Let me ask you one other question. Small thing. What are these vertical lines coming down? Are they downspouts?

Gretchen Yahn: Yes.

**Bill Anderson:** What about the one between the double window?

**Gretchen Yahn:** We're actually doing a breakup. We're doing a water break up above to move water to the sides.

**Bill Anderson:** How are you going to get it past the [inaudible]?

**Gretchen Yahn:** No, no, no. You'll do it. It's just at the stairs. Just at the stairs. They'll be another one. They'll have to be another one [multiple speakers]. Yeah, there'll be another one there.

**Bill Anderson:** What color are the gutters? I mean, the downspouts.

**Gretchen Yahn:** These downspouts on the rock. Is this Revere Pewter or Rockport? I'm sorry. [inaudible] Revere Pewter. Yeah. Yeah. So, yeah, they're black. So they'll be black.

**Bill Anderson:** There you go. That'll help break it up too.

Gretchen Yahn: Yeah.

**Tim Clites:** All right. So thank you to the rest of the committee for your patience while we chatted through this. Are there any. I'll go round the room one more time to see if there are any other comments on this application.

Tim Clites: Cindy.

**Cindy Pearson:** I'll pass. She had something. I'm good.

Tim Clites: Oh. Virginia.

**Virginia Jenkins:** Back to the left elevation, the windows on the first floor. What are their sizes? The two, I can't read it on the.

**Gretchen Yahn:** I probably see it on the one if we expand it.

**Virginia Jenkins:** Is it on?

Gretchen Yahn: I should have brought mine.

**Virginia Jenkins:** Am I missing something somewhere?

Gretchen Yahn: So it should be a left. [multiple speakers] Yeah, Go to the. There's a schedule sheet. No,

there's a schedule on one of the pages. Then it's on the next.

**Virginia Jenkins:** I just didn't look at the schedule. Sorry. Sorry.

Tim Clites: It's 3050, I think.

Gretchen Yahn: It would be the other elevation. I'm sorry, Will.

Virginia Jenkins: Too many pieces of paper.

**Bill Anderson:** I think they're three by four because there's a window schedule, the window A?

Gretchen Yahn: Yeah, it's window A.

**Bill Anderson:** 3 by 4.

Gretchen Yahn: Yeah. Three foot by four foot.

**Virginia Jenkins:** I don't know. Proportionately, they just look so small.

**Bill Anderson:** Because that's a big elevation.

**Virginia Jenkins:** I know. So you have all this flat space. I know. I know.

**Tim Clites:** One of the things that Bill just observed, it's not in the elevation, too, to either side of those windows. There'll be another downspout, which if you just envision that because that little piece of roof between.

between.

Virginia Jenkins: Oh yeah. I see that.

**Tim Clites:** Between the dormers. Right. Which will kind of help. Which would kind of help frame that

window.

**Virginia Jenkins:** Yeah, I know, but it's just. Its height and then.

**Gretchen Yahn:** Well, the F windows. Can we go to the what the.

**Tim Clites:** So that one of them goes above a tub and the other goes at the end of the bathroom.

**Virginia Jenkins:** I understand. I understand. I've been looking at the floor plan to figure out. It just proportionately it looks so small to me, and I think it's because there's so much stucco on the outside of it.

**Punkin Lee:** I think so much stucco. And then you look to the second floor and there's it's so busy with the. The lines of the roof and the wind, you know, it's like.

**Virginia Jenkins:** So I'm not completely crazy.

Bill Anderson: No.

**Punkin Lee:** It looks top heavy.

**Gretchen Yahn:** You know, I would recommend, though, that if we not if doing the fake shutters, I would do a twin. So it looks the same as the one above. I wouldn't. I wouldn't center. Or don't you agree? So that really will kind of bring the massing in there as I mean help with the massing on that side as well. So I would advocate that we would have two, we'd have a set of twins and a set of twins on the other side and just.

**Tim Clites:** And the downspouts.

Gretchen Yahn: And the down. yeah.

Tim Clites: Virginia. Anything else?

Virginia Jenkins: That's it. I'm done. Thank you.

Tim Clites: Linda.

**Linda Wright:** No, I'm good with the changes, I think.

Gretchen Yahn: I think it'll be good.

**Punkin Lee:** I think the changes will definitely give that wide expanse of stucco some better definition. A little more detail. Would that make [inaudible].

**Tim Clites:** [inaudible]

Punkin Lee: And I think that'll definitely help break up that large amount of stucco. Thank you.

**Tim Clites:** Bill, do you want to try to summarize that in a motion. [inaudible] I knew he'd be game for it.

**Bill Anderson:** Might ask to ask the panel something I'm trying to picture. I'm losing my memory fast as the years go on. A barn structure in the Middleburg area that's made this big, that's made us stucco. It's not relevant to the approval of this. I'm just curious. I have it right here. Do you. Have you seen.

**Gretchen Yahn:** Over on Sam Fred Road there's a big white one over there. It's white and black. You see, I can picture a couple more of these that are out there, but I'm just saying it's not inappropriate. You see a lot of and a lot of them actually were whitewashed or, you know, kind of plastered over stone or brick or things that over time were leaking.

**Punkin Lee:** A couple in Mount [inaudible] too.

Gretchen Yahn: Yeah.

Punkin Lee: The white with the black stucco.

**Gretchen Yahn:** There's is white and black, and it's pretty big. So the difference is what you're seeing on that one elevation, too, is this is a story and a half where the other ones, we were seeing the roof come down much further. But again, that speaks to that kind of barn type of look as well.

**Bill Anderson:** What's really interesting is the I think on the I don't have it open, but I think front elevation shows a human scale figure. But it's only on one elevation. And for folks that don't read plans all the time, that human figure is really good to have in every elevation because they can really sense what the scale is. And again, not [inaudible]. COA RS 22-10 to approve with the following comments. On the left elevation the lower three by four windows would be shuttered with passive shutters. The downspouts to be added between the dormers as shown, like the other downspouts and the dormer windows or excuse me, the the facade board to be removed and the dormer windows to be profiled with trim.

**Tim Clites:** Can I add one point of clarification? I'd like to walk over and show Bill this sketch and then I'll show it to everyone else.

Gretchen Yahn: And I will redraw it to.

**Tim Clites:** [off mic]

**Bill Anderson:** Fake shutters. I thought. I thought we were going to put shutters here.

**Tim Clites:** Well, that's. I understood this, so I'm glad you bring it up so we can make sure.

Bill Anderson: I'd rather have a blank wall than a fake shutter myself.

**Tim Clites:** So I. Because what Punkin understood was shutters on that.

Bill Anderson: Yeah, that's What I thought, too. That's why I said three by four.

**Tim Clites:** That's what you said. I just want to make sure everyone understands. So on that window, shutters on the side. Nothing in this panel of stucco. [off mic]

**Gretchen Yahn:** But remember, Bill, our fake shutters. You know, we. We literally get a window frame. We put them in and [multiple speakers] actually see the hardware at that juncture. That's the nice part.

**Tim Clites:** Want to. Yeah, I just I know. I want to make sure the committee understands what we're. Yeah.

**Bill Anderson:** And then we should find out what everybody would like to do. [off mic]

**Tim Clites:** Bill and Punkin understood the shutter, the quote faux shutters we were talking about were to flank these little windows. In my mind, we were talking about faux shutters to take up part of the stucco under the dormer. And in other projects we've had both a combination of both. We've had some windows with shutters on and then we've had other windows where you you trim that, that gets trimmed out like a window with the shutters closed. What are you wiggling your nose about? Which which one don't you like?

**Virginia Jenkins:** The windows with the shutters closed.

**Tim Clites:** You don't like this? Okay, that's fine. So that's. I don't get to vote. So that's at least right now, three of the five of you agree. So there's a motion on the table.

**Will Moore:** If I may. We need to make sure the applicant is okay.

**Tim Clites:** Understanding what we're saying. Do you understand what they're saying? Shutters.

**Gretchen Yahn:** I don't care either way. So you tell me.

Will Moore: I think the applicant was envisioning.

**Gretchen Yahn:** I was.

Will Moore: The faux shutters, double width underneath the double dormer window, [off mic]

**Tim Clites:** That's right.

**Will Moore:** We're talking about something different. We just want to make sure if. If we're adding shutters to an existing window and not doing anything with that blank space that is an ok solution.

**Tim Clites:** In any case, these would be the know there's a shutter at the gable end here, a kind of a faux shutter up on the second floor.

**Virginia Jenkins:** Why wouldn't there be a shutter on the rear elevation on the other side.

**Tim Clites:** Where?

Gretchen Yahn: The rear. Those windows are really big.

**Virginia Jenkins:** Isn't that the rear elevation? The bottom one?

**Tim Clites:** Yeah. Here?

Virginia Jenkins: No. The window on the right.

**Tim Clites:** There. Well, the only reason we started this conversation is to embellish slightly that facade for the neighbor.

Virginia Jenkins: Why would you have shutters on two windows and that's it?

**Cindy Pearson:** And why would you have shutters on a window in a barn?

**Tim Clites:** I don't want to overthink it one way or the other. We've overthought it plenty.

**Gretchen Yahn:** We if you want shudders, if you would like fake shutters, the faux shutters closed effect and then have a shudder on those others that's in the operable one on it, that's fine as well, because then that would read all the way across the shutter.

Tim Clites: Faux shutter.

**Gretchen Yahn:** [inaudible] Operable shutter. Yep. And then it speaks to everybody's thought and then it's on there. So, I mean, it's not a big deal. And then it speaks to it speaks to the massing.

**Tim Clites:** Let me ask this question. Do you need this signed off on since it's the first time we've looked at [inaudible] scheme tonight.

Gretchen Yahn: Yeah, her permit is going to be coming out. It's not to say that I couldn't. [inaudible]

**Tim Clites:** Isn't going to change the structure or the layout or anything. This is totally aesthetic.

**Gretchen Yahn:** So her permit comes out.

**Tim Clites:** If we need to update the elevation anyway.

Tim Clites: That's fine.

Will Moore: I could. I could clear her zoning permit on this pending.

Gretchen Yahn: That's fine.

**Tim Clites:** Pending the final. [multiple speakers]

Gretchen Yahn: And I can do an option both ways so that way you could see it both ways. And then you could say. [multiple speakers] That's fine.

Tim Clites: So the project is approved pending of you, of. And so now let's. And let's. You'll have to redo the motion being clear about what the two options are we'd like to see.

**Punkin Lee:** So the new drawing would have the two downspouts that are not indicated now, correct. Yeah. In addition to the shutter activity.

Will Moore: If I can simplify the motion. Just a motion to table. And then I understand from this conversation that I'm good to clear her on her zoning permit anyway, so that's fine she can get. I'm going to get permitting with Loudoun and then just a motion to table tonight, and then she'll return next month, and we can.

Gretchen Yahn: And I'll do two options. So you see both of them Ok.

Virginia Jenkins: And you're talking about just one more clarification. When you're talking about fake excuse me, faux shutters, are you talking like a barn shutter or are you talking about.

Tim Clites: It's the same shutter that we've approved on the other. It's in this detail, right? It's these shutters. These faux shutters to say fake just means that they're not an authentic operating right. It's the shutters that have previously been approved. Yeah.

Virginia Jenkins: They're just not moving.

Tim Clites: Right.

Gretchen Yahn: And the nice part about a faux shutter when it's closed is you're actually seeing the hardware whereby when they're open, all you're seeing is the [inaudible]. So there is some nice parts of seeing it, you know, a little detail.

**Bill Anderson:** Suggesting table.

**Tim Clites:** Is that your motion?

**Bill Anderson:** That's not in the motion.

**Tim Clites:** Just do the motion to.

**Rhonda North:** You're withdrawing your first motion.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah. We just don't want to get [inaudible].

Bill Anderson: All right, we'll make a motion. COA RS 22-10. A motion is to table until our next

meeting.

**Tim Clites:** I second. All those in favor.

**Everyone:** Aye.

**Tim Clites:** Any opposed. Thank you. Thanks, Gretchen. You got one more. RS. COA RS 22-11 request of Gretchen Yahn for a new single-family dwelling at 609 Martindale Ridge Drive, Middleburg residence, Lot 15. And this is similar in planning and elevation. I'll just jump in here to the first application that we saw, the difference being that there is stucco as the primary facade material and there is siding at the I'll call it the enclosed porches.

**Gretchen Yahn:** And we have a walkout on this one, which has a landscape wall to the front. Kind of like you're seeing on the other ones now.

**Punkin Lee:** And this stone on the right elevation is the same stone we're carrying through.

Gretchen Yahn: Yep.

**Tim Clites:** Cindy, any comments?

**Cindy Pearson:** No, not yet.

Tim Clites: Okay. Thank you, Virginia.

Virginia Jenkins: No, no comment.

Tim Clites: Linda.

**Linda Wright:** I like the right elevation a lot. I think that adds a lot of character and all that to all of that. And with the walk out and how that's worked in and adding the siding and the stone gives it a lot of character. I like that.

Tim Clites: Thank you. Punkin.

**Punkin Lee:** I agree with Linda. I think kind of the mixture is nice, but not that much of it, that it's like they couldn't decide what to do. Some houses look.

Tim Clites: Thank you, Bill.

**Bill Anderson:** All right. I think this looks good. Also there's no downspouts shown in these elevations.

**Gretchen Yahn:** We typically haven't been showing them, but we can if you want us to show them. It's a little difficult on some of these because we're trying to make a couple of game time decisions on whether it's on these two pillars or I mean, these two posts or those two posts and what looks better.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah, I think on the last application, they actually helped a lot with just breaking up the facade. This seems to have a scale.

**Bill Anderson:** And the fact that they're black. I mean, that's going to affect anything.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah, sure. Especially on the lighter colors. Right?

**Bill Anderson:** But just for being truthful.

**Tim Clites:** I don't have any comments. [off mic]

Gretchen Yahn: Yes, it is.

Tim Clites: I don't. I know it's hard to believe.

**Virginia Jenkins:** Very hard to believe.

**Gretchen Yahn:** So, yeah, it is a hot box.

**Tim Clites:** Well, that's again, I'm taking it at face value. That last application, the stucco was brought up into the side of the dormers. But here it's the flat panel, and I'm assuming that's what you want.

Gretchen Yahn: Yes.

**Tim Clites:** It took me a minute. I'll be honest, to wrap my mind around the rear elevation, looking at that wide porch that had two columns that didn't exist in that plan. And then there was no. And finally I was like, and I had to wrap my mind around from the front the whole way to the back to realize there's the little pilaster between the stucco and the siding to make that work. It's like, All right. Got it? Yeah. The first time. Where's the column? Like, where's that? Anyway, it makes sense to me now. Any other comments from anyone on the committee? Any questions? Has everyone had enough time to review it?

Bill Anderson: Could you repeat your comment again about the columns and the pilaster?

**Tim Clites:** This was just admitting that I'm getting a little slow in my old age, too. If you look at that rear elevation, it appears like there's six columns in a row at first blush. But in fact, the column at the corner of the porch. The next column in on both sides is back at the back of the porch next to the window. It's a little pilaster that allows the stucco to die into one side of it. [inaudible] But I kept trying to find the column and plan the first time, and then I realized that it's not that's not what's happening here. So it is a pretty big span for those two columns at the at the back. Right.

**Gretchen Yahn:** We've got some [inaudible] down there.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah. But I can see why you do it with the with the wall of glass there. You want to be able to look out kind of unobstructed.

**Bill Anderson:** [off mic]

Tim Clites: Yeah.

**Gretchen Yahn:** And that is a finaudible is going to open all to one side.

**Virginia Jenkins:** [inaudible]

Gretchen Yahn: Which would be pretty nice.

**Virginia Jenkins:** [off mic]

**Tim Clites:** All right. And seeing no further input, I'm happy if someone would like to make a motion.

**Bill Anderson:** Okay.

Virginia Jenkins: Go ahead.

**Bill Anderson:** Please.

Virginia Jenkins: You're on a roll. Just go on.

**Bill Anderson:** I make a motion for COA RS 22-11 to approve as presented.

Virginia Jenkins: Second.

**Tim Clites:** All those in favor.

Everyone: Aye.

**Tim Clites:** Any opposed? Abstain. Motion passes. Thank you.

Gretchen Yahn: Thank you. And I'll get that together for you for next month. I'll be back for the garages.

**Tim Clites:** See you then. All right.

Rhonda North: Mr. Chairman.

**Tim Clites:** We have some discussion items next. I'm sorry. I should interrupt myself. Would you like to go out of order on discussion items or. I just answer my own question. I didn't realize they were here to review, so I thought maybe if they were here on discussion items, we could change the sequence. Okay. Okay. Great.

**Gretchen Yahn:** Can I ask one question. It's an interpretation question. It maybe Will. And you guys know, and this is getting asked the one car garage on the vineyards. Based on the I can't find just definitive if we go. I think it was based upon the fact that the impervious area allowed for just a one car garage in.

**Tim Clites:** So we wouldn't know. That's all zoning.

**Gretchen Yahn:** I just wonder if it was part of the proffer. So that's what I was just trying to. So I'm just I'm trying to get clarification because if somebody does a smaller than the question is, can the garage go bigger? I don't know the answer to that.

Tim Clites: I don't know either.

Rhonda North: That's a Will question.

**Tim Clites:** I think it's probably the proffers in the zoning more than us.

**Gretchen Yahn:** [multiple speakers] Thank you. I just didn't know somebody knew off the top of their head, since.

**Tim Clites:** There's not a lot left on the top of my head. Let's not go there. All right, Discussion item 5A I'm having trouble with my Roman numerals. 2023 Historic Preservation Awards.

**Estee LaClare:** Yes. Thank you, Chairman Clites. So what I wanted to do was get you all thinking about the different ones for nominations, because we had established this process last year. And so I wrote up a memo just kind of detailing what we determined to be the two awards, along with the timeline that we had discussed. And from there, I put together basically all the different projects we've been approving over the last three years. So you can look at the ones and I also went through and the ones who are no longer within the town, who closed up or moved on, if you will. I've noted that as well. And the ones who won last year.

**Virginia Jenkins:** [off mic]

**Punkin Lee:** There's a lot of signs.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah, but remember when we went, they said, Oh, yeah, y'all, y'all from Middleburg. You're known for your signs. That's what they told us.

Linda Wright: We do have some good ones.

**Tim Clites:** I know we do. So just this is our list. Remind us again of the process. As I remember, we got a beautiful jump on our schedule this year, right? You're starting us out first of the year.

**Estee LaClare:** I'm starting us out approximately five months early, if you will. Yeah, because we wanted to make sure that we went through this process and we're able to give the award out in May, which is Historic Preservation Month.

Tim Clites: Right.

**Estee LaClare:** So that's why I included in the memo the two different designations and the awards along with you said number 17 take off. [inaudible] So essentially all I would like, basically I'm giving you all homework. So to go through it and see which ones you think might stand out. We did not do many signs last year when we we just concluded the signs with the two [multiple speakers] Yeah, right. We combined them. So we have some flexibility.

Punkin Lee: Do you want to submit names to you like we did.

**Estee LaClare:** That would be fabulous. And if you would like, I can email you next week as a reminder. Can you please take the opportunity to review and let me know? You could also just think about it, and we could talk some more about it the next month as well. We have time. That's why I wanted to get this process going early.

**Tim Clites:** Thank you.

Estee LaClare: You're welcome.

**Tim Clites:** And just as a reminder for everyone, the legacy can be a person, a building, or an institution. Which is kind of a. There's something about that flexibility of that that I really like, right? Like we can right, as we all know, we started with Bill, but doesn't mean it needs to be a person again this year. Right. And we can kind of bounce around. Yeah. Cool. Thank you, Estee.

Estee LaClare: You're welcome.

**Tim Clites:** This is awesome. Keeping us all organized. Any questions on all of that? So we're going to send some initial comments to the staff and and then we'll pick it back up again next month. Middleburg Walking Tour Draft. Tell us about this. It looks like a lot of work in here.

Estee LaClare: So essentially what I've been doing for quite a while, I went through all the different Middleburg walking tour pamphlets and some other information that we've had on file here, and I combined them as well as expanded upon some of the properties and included other ones that I thought needed to be noticed. So what I've done is about nine pages, so there is no timeline, but I would appreciate your feedback. Kind of like how we handle the design guidelines. If you would like to review the write ups or add or take away any of the properties as well. And like I said, we have plenty of time. There is absolutely no deadline for this. It's whenever you might have an opportunity to review it. I know that Ali would like to choose our economic development, or she would like to start her and I in conjunction with social media, highlighting a property and then including this list down the road to try to get more information out to the public. And we'd like to include it on the website along with like if you could do like a QR code for people with the walking tour so that they could kind of go around and see the different properties.

**Punkin Lee:** Is this to revise this one?

Estee LaClare: Yes, ma'am. Yes. I figured it was time. It's been almost 20 years.

Punkin Lee: Beautification [inaudible].

**Estee LaClare:** But I don't know if we actually need to publish something that that we can discuss that further down the road. But I just figured you all are experts, and you're very good at this, and you worked on past publications. So if you could provide me any feedback of what you think should be on there, what shouldn't? I'd appreciate it. Or if any tidbits of information you think we need to further expand upon to.

**Cindy Pearson:** I think on a few of them maybe need a little bit more of the history. Like the I'm I didn't read more than a page of them or and just didn't really go into it to like the pink box because that has a lot of really interesting history between the first thing and the last thing is to get a little bit more of the in between history there, which I think a few of these is what makes it. It gives it the historical history or whatever, however you'd like to word that. And I know you'll need help with that, because that would be hard to pull out, I'm sure. Well, not just the pink box. There's other ones, too. Yeah.

Estee LaClare: I wasn't when I started this. I wasn't sure how in-depth to go.

**Cindy Pearson:** Because, like, the charter school, I mean, that had so much other history other than the charter school. It was a high school. It had a jail out front. I mean, there's a lot of things that that property had going on with the.

**Punkin Lee:** I was in the last graduating high school class.

**Tim Clites:** Of the jail?

Punkin Lee: Probably.

**Tim Clites:** Wow, you come from selling stock. [laughter] [off mic]

**Estee LaClare:** Any tidbits of information you would like to share if you would? Like I said, this is there is not a deadline. There's not a hard deadline. This was a project I had talked to Will, I said they haven't been updated in 20 years and I really kind of want it. And I also took the different survey that was done in 2016 and went through that to include more additional properties. So I'm happy to delve into deeper research. I enjoy that immensely.

**Cindy Pearson:** And that's where you need to get a recorder and speak to a few people around them. [off mic]

**Estee LaClare:** That's further back. It's like page maybe eight. [off mic] Catawba Corporation, Gibson House 209. East Washington Street.

Virginia Jenkins: [off mic]

**Estee LaClare:** And I did have that in the. Well, the Emmanuel Episcopal Church purchased this house. [off mic] Okay, I'll write that in there. Thank you.

Virginia Jenkins: [off mic]

**Estee LaClare:** And so essentially, this is just for you to review and provide me with your feedback. If you and the other component is if you don't think it's a worthwhile endeavor, I mean, that's fine too. I just wanted to update some of this information and I'm happy to come visit you and you guys can sit down with me and go through the different properties if you have additional information that I was unable to locate. [off mic]

**Tim Clites:** Thank you.

**Estee LaClare:** Thank you very much. And last but not least, on our list is a synopsis.

Estee LaClare: Yes. So essentially, I watched that webinar I told you all about, and it basically it looked into the driving forces for the mid-century development patterns, including design influences and building trends. It wasn't boring. I enjoyed it very much. I'm sorry. And it identify key housing types associated with the mid-century. So I basically did a summary for you. If you were interested in reading it. I found it to be quite interesting the last few minutes, not so much, but they talk about essentially the GI Bill really kind of catapulted after World War Two. That's when, of course, you are all aware of that with the boomers and here. [off mic] Ridgeview is a perfect example. Right. And I always tell people like those were some catalog homes and they're quite extensive and they did go into that in the webinar. So at any rate, I just wanted to provide you with a summary. The only other thing I need from you all this evening is if you could please let me know how many hours of training you have done. Because by the end of January, I have to submit the report and.

**Virginia Jenkins:** How long is each one of those things?

**Estee LaClare:** Well, those other ones that Margaret I know did a few. Those are approximately an hour and a half to 3 hours, depending. Oftentimes they have quite a lot of discussions. So you don't have to listen to that component. [off mic] You both emailed me that you each did about an hour and a half.

**Virginia Jenkins:** Well, I did the whole thing.

**Tim Clites:** She fell asleep an hour and a half in.

**Cindy Pearson:** But just read this thing that you gave us here. That's what. 10, 15 minutes.

**Tim Clites:** Slow down on the reading. Come on. [off mic]

**Estee LaClare:** So that's great. Thank you very much. And I appreciate that. So I'll put you down for 4 hours.

Virginia Jenkins: Works for me.

**Estee LaClare:** Virginia is going to get the Gold Star. [multiple speakers] What I can do is send out an email and inquire about the different things we've discussed tonight. And then just as a reminder, next week gives you some time, because I know this is a lot to ask, but also the tour we did, there is not a hard deadline, so we are flexible with that.

**Linda Wright:** Can you attach some of the links to some of those?

Estee LaClare: Happy to do that. Yes, I am. [off mic]

Tim Clites: Yes, Rhonda.

Rhonda North: Mr. Chair, I apologize for being late. I had a meeting that ran a little long, and I know I'm going to sound like a broken record, but we have a lot of folks who watch our videotapes and watch the live broadcasts of the meetings. And I'm really starting to receive more complaints. Just ask that, folks. Please speak into your microphones and make sure your microphones are on and identify yourself. The latest one really is people in the audience who are speaking and not coming forward. And I've had a conversation with the staff about coming to the microphone when they need to speak. And you may have noticed I was given the evil eye to some folks who kept speaking in the corner back there. All of those things makes it hard for the public who watch remotely our meetings to hear and understand also makes it more difficult on the transcribers who have to to produce the transcriptions of the meetings. And those transcriptions help us meet our ADA requirements. So they are very important.

**Tim Clites:** Quick question for you along those lines, I've been trying to name the person, but would it be better for each of us to state our name before we speak, or is that too much effort?

**Rhonda North:** That's what the Planning Commission members do when they speak. They just say, you know, Ed here speaking or Terry here speaking, and then they then go on and say whatever comment they have to say. And, you know, I think that makes it easy. But even the way you do it, when you say, you know, Cindy, do you have any comments? And then Cindy speaks that that's helpful as well. It does allow the viewing audience who may not know everyone to know who's speaking.

Punkin Lee: What's the average of listeners for HDRC?

**Rhonda North:** Based on the comments I've received, more people watch the HDRC meetings than the other meetings. [off mic] You're on record, you don't go off record.

**Tim Clites:** Yeah, there is no off record. Remember that. All right. Well, thank you for that reminder. If you could remind us again the beginning of the next meeting, if the committee feels more comfortable stating their name or just having me try to be more diligent about, I mean, the other the reason I think I started that was that we because we are so collaborative in our discussion, we often talk one right over the next. And so that was my attempt to try to help us kind of stay in our lanes a little. If that's adequate and everyone's comfortable, we can continue to do that as opposed to stating our name. But whatever the committees. Yeah, but just remind us again. Thank you, Rhonda.

**Cindy Pearson:** Keeping us in our lanes. Good. Thank you. Appreciate that.

**Tim Clites:** All right. Do we have February the second? Do we know any absentees right now or do we have a meeting quorum? [multiple speakers] So if we. If anybody has something come up, please let the staff know as soon as possible otherwise, we'll presume we have a quorum. And with that, we are adjourned. Oh, I'm sorry. Can we be re not adjourned? Was there a question the staff had for me related to the building that we need now? There's no questions. Right. Okay, then. As I was saying, we're adjourned.